

**GSSCORE**

**An Institute for Civil Services**

**IAS TOPPER'S**

**TEST COPY**

**AMAN JHA**

**RANK - 400**

**ETHICS, INTEGRITY  
AND APTITUDE  
TEST - 3**



**www.iasscore.in**

## ETHICS, INTEGRITY AND APTITUDE

Time Allowed: 3 hrs.

Max. Marks: 250

Q.	Marks	Instructions to Candidate
1.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• There are 19 questions.</li><li>• All questions are compulsory</li><li>• The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.</li><li>• Content of the answer is more important than its length.</li><li>• Answers must be written in the space provided.</li></ul> <p>Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">98½</p>
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		
7.		
8.		
9.		
10.		
11.		
12.		
13.		
14.		
15.		
16.		
17.		
18.		
19.		

1. Invigilator Signature

2. Invigilator Signature

Name Aman Kumar Jha

Roll No. \_\_\_\_\_

Mobile No. \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

Signature 

## Section - A

1. "You can trust the Government to keep you content and happy so that you may give your best, but it would be unworthy of you to make that a condition of service." How is this advice of Sardar Patel important for civil servants of India in particular and any developing society in general? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

This advice of Patel underlines the reality for any developing country where civil servants have to act more out of dedication to public service than expecting luxuries of a cushy corporate job.

Reason Do you think material benefits play an important role in dedication?

In countries like India, civil servants need a certain level of protection - i.e.

- (a) job security in face of political pressure
- (b) stable income to meet ~~minimum~~ minimum needs
- (c) post-retirement pension

All this is to protect them from undue political pressure. But, at the same

time, they have to reorient their motivational compass.

Remarks

In developing countries, asking for privileges commensurate to the responsibility one has undertaken, would be rather selfish e.g. cabinet secretary may clear projects worth hundreds of crores. But, he can't be paid like employees / board management of a billion dollar company.

They have to ~~retain~~ retain a selfless posture. Being motivated by a sense of duty rather than ~~calibrating~~ calibrating job performance according to material benefits accrued. Else, he/she may get attracted to corruption.

Therefore, civil servants should derive comfort from job security but should be ready to take bold decisions / selfless decisions without expecting commensurate reward.

Do you think civil servant shall have approach of calling towards work?

84/82

2. "When stakes are high, integrity becomes expensive." Put forth your understanding with suitable examples. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

The perpetual dilemma for anyone in a "moral accountability" situation is how to prioritise public interest over private interest.

Integrity simply means adherence to high moral standards. Doing what nobody asked, but everybody expected.

A work environment where values are in full display, adhering to them makes life easy rather than challenging.

e.g. ~~playing a~~ walking away even when umpire hasn't given you out.

However, it is entirely different when outcomes are valued more than integrity.

Remarks

e.g. A final match of world cup may compel the same batter to remain at the crease when wrongfully given "not out".

Similarly, being honest <sup>(becomes difficult)</sup> when it will most certainly be ~~for~~ punished with ~~the~~ dismissal, enquiry, transfer, scapegoating and witch-hunting, ~~for~~ e.g. Julian Assange.

Still, adhering to the call of conscience is more ~~not~~ important worthy than saving ~~of~~ oneself or our material possessions.

As Bhagwat Gita talks about, doing your duty, without worrying for outcome.

Thus, outcome may be favourable, unconcerned or extremely prejudicial to our self interest, but, following our values is for more important.

Do you think in time of personal difficulties etc, it is hard to maintain integrity!

4

3. Are civil servants morally autonomous? What checks her moral autonomy and why?  
(150 Words) (10 Marks)

A civil servant, being a human, has his own moral compass. But, his freedom to choose is defined by constitutional, legal, rational and moral principles.

A private person has a considerable moral autonomy especially in his/her personal life e.g. to right to privacy.

are there any more angles of moral autonomy?

However, - public service is marked by the ethos of duty. - People expect them to act in a certain way.

And, they must act in that way. Their ~~morally~~ moral autonomy is constrained by the fact, even when, laws are

Remarks

Silent and discretion has prevailed, they still have to be guided by ideal by public utility of their action.

Their action must create public values, not destroy them. e.g. A civil servant may think that capital punishment is immoral or weed is a simple recreational drug. Still, he has to enforce law in both ~~these~~ these cases, going ~~against~~ against his own moral compass.

The dilemma argument here is that his duty to uphold legal-constitutional law order overrides supercedes his own sense of fairness.

There, even ~~the~~ when civil servants use their moral discretion, their decisions must fall on the side of public service.

But do you think some time civil servants have to act as per their morality out of empathy etc.?

(4)

4. Which of the following involve ethical dilemmas? Identify values at conflict, if any

- (a) Arresting a person with an antisocial image under public pressure
- (b) Removing a dalit cook from MDM scheme if attendance falls down
- (c) Using public office for private gain

(150 Words) (10 Marks)

Introduce the term "ethical dilemma" briefly.

(a) Maxim of legality vs public opinion

→ One can't be arrested without breaking a law. Preventive detention is provided for an imminent act of crime.

→ But, someone can't be arrested because of his/her image adheres to or ~~is~~ violates the broad category of being "anti" or "pro" ~~social~~ social.   
 values such as objectivity, rationality etc.

(b) Compassion towards weaker section vs right to education of children

→ ~~How~~ However, the situation precludes any ethical dilemma. Because, ~~removing~~ removing the cooking staff is just not an

Remarks

option.

One should try to work on the cultural attitude of parents who are mistakenly passing on this relic of feudalism to their children.

utilitarianism against deontology etc.

It is an act of corruption.

It has no ethical <sup>dilemma</sup> angle, as the act of using public office for private gain is the textbook example of corruption.

Therefore, ethical dilemma is when you have to prioritize between two right things to do. When, answer is rationally clear, only question is how to do it.

(4)

5. "We stand committed to protecting honest and well meaning civil servants who might have made genuine errors in their work." Why, according to former PM Manmohan Singh, protecting the honest civil servant is important? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Development administration would come to a stand still if no decision is taken without understanding the full ~~range~~ range of its implications. The genuine mistake must be entertained.

Discuss what could lead to genuine mistakes by civil servants

The utilitarian idea of justifying legality or morality of an administrative decision ~~is~~ has a major flaw. And, it is that it presumes that all the consequences can be immediately known.

However, a famous American diplomat, Donald Rumsfeld once said that there are two types of unknown - known unknown, and

Remarks

① unknown unknown.

→ often, a sound policy like giving coal blocks on the basis of "first come, first serve basis" may seem reasonable at the time.

→ If they prove to have benefitted some parties underly, it doesn't mean that the corruption has taken place.

→ This instills a profound indecisiveness among ~~not~~ civil servant, which will harm development administration as they need to act proactively and often sans precedence.

→ They must feel safe from 3Cs - CVC, CBI and courts.

A dash of integrity is better than the cynical caution that perpetuates status quo.

Discuss what could be the impact if enough protection is not given to the officers like harassment by corrupt officials etc

37

6. "The transfer is the politicians' basic weapon of control over the bureaucracy and thus the lever for surplus-extraction from the clients of the bureaucracy." Explain.  
(150 Words) (10 Marks)

Transfer uproots the entire family of a bureaucrat. Therefore, it prevents the bureaucrats from giving a free, frank and fair advice.

Discus  
the rationale  
behind the provision  
of transfer.

Constitution makers fully grasped the need to provide job safety to the bureaucrats who were certain to come under ~~undemocratic~~ undemocratic pressure from various quarters.

yet, democratic accountability required that the political executive be free to churn them out if they let them down in meeting public mandate.

Remarks

But, the power to transfer is used to pressure the bureaucrats to do following things, like;

- ① Obey unwritten and often illegal orders
- ② Generate corrupt money to fund political activities.
- ③ Keep their contrarian views on public policy off the official file and adopt policies or practices that are not in public interest.

However, a bureaucrat, if not supported by his cadre, should endorse this pain calmly. In a recently released autobiography, Anil Swaroop retorted that just as death is certain, so is trans for. Learn to accept it.

Good approach!

④

7. Pondering upon the quote: "Conscience is to law as a brush is to paint.", critically evaluate the significance of conscience as a source of ethical guidance.

(150 Words) (10 Marks)

You can't paint without a brush. Similarly, if a law militates against the conscience of the citizens then they are simply unjust and unsuitable for a democratic society.

Discuss what is conscience.

Law ensures minimum morality. This means that the ~~text~~ underlying strata of morality under the edifice of law is unmistakably needed.

When a law implements our

Discuss how it could

conscience, it is a good law and will certainly generate public value. e.g. abolition of sati.

help to implement as per particular circumstance

But, if a law militates against the conscience then it destroys public

Remarks

value. e.g. victimisation of dissent under archaic penal laws.

The easy way is to change the law to make it, "conscience compliant". But, a ~~mandatory~~ "sun set clauses" may also aid a periodic re-examination of law.

But, we can't give conscience a blank check. What may appear morally permissible at one point or time, may appear ~~also~~ abhorrent to other people or generation. e.g. Nazi Germany.

Do-you think the primary source of ethical obligations by civil servants?

The call of conscience must undergo a rigorous duel with "reason" and their child will create maximum public value. e.g. gradation of quantum of punishment to repeat offenders of minor crimes.

34

8. The response of a public servant towards the value of 'accountability' can be varied. Some may welcome it in the spirit of trustworthiness and ownership and others can despise it as liability, fear and punishment. Discuss. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Accountability means being answerable for your actions and one should acknowledge that it is ~~an~~ a means to an end, rather an indispensable means.

In India, evolution of public service has a long history of ~~etc~~ colonial arrogance. <sup>It has</sup> feudal ideas and asymmetry of power engrained in it.

Due to these reasons, "mai-bafi" culture develops. People were treated as clients, beneficiaries, mendicants, subjects, etc.

Due to the institutional memory of such condescension, public servants still

Remarks

Sometimes think that ~~account~~ <sup>accountability</sup> is an unnecessary liberal concession to an uneducated and uninformed ~~set~~ public.

Various accountability procedures like replying to RTI queries take time and resources. Decision taken under discretion may appear corrupt in the light of accountability.

However, some civil servants especially the ones with a democratic spirit and integrity will like to ~~or~~ conduct themselves in full public view.

Openly taken decisions reduce pressure to harass honest officers as well?   
 say that accountability may be used

from vested interests and help in delivering effective, economic and efficient good governance.

e.g. social audits allow lower level functionaries to deny demand of illegal qualification by-by elected officials.

9. Distinguish between "Code of ethics" and "Code of conduct" with suitable examples  
(150 Words) (10 Marks)

⇒ Code of conduct tells us what not to do, but, code of ethics tells us what ought to do.

There are many codes of conduct for specified targeted ~~to~~ cadre of civil servants. Depending upon the nature of opportunities for corruption in their line of work, specific do's and don't's are enumerated in codes of conduct like All India Services (conduct) rules. e.g. not taking gifts above certain threshold value.

However, administrations' s tentacles spread so vast as that the law often fails to guide behaviour. Often, new policies have to be made into hitherto

Remarks

unchartered territory. e.g. policy on ~~robotics~~  
~~data~~ data privacy

In these moral ~~vacc~~ legal vacuums,  
 where law is silent and precedences  
 don't exist, ~~to~~ the public servants  
 have to be guided by ~~the~~ their ~~the~~  
 public ~~service~~ service values. e.g. Stand  
ards ~~in~~ in public life given by  
Wolan committee.

Even, one is not ~~to~~ told what to do,  
 one know what is accepted? which  
 values must be upheld? These values  
 essentially constitute "code of ethics"

In fact, code of ethics should give  
 sufficient flexibility to public servant to  
 act when ~~conduct~~ conduct rules and law fail  
 to show compassion to ~~weak~~ weaker  
 sections

Good approach!

4 1/2

10. In the recent past, many bureaucrats have been seen joining political parties. Does this post-retirement engagement affect the cherished value of political neutrality of civil servants in expectation of quid pro quo? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Neutrality ~~Impartiality~~ is a foundational value of the ~~civil~~ civil services. They must serve a necessary cooling off ~~period~~ <sup>period</sup> before joining politics.

Spirit of a professional civil service in a democracy comes from its neutrality and non-partisanship. Only then, it can ensure <sup>a</sup> smooth transition between two democratically elected ~~govern~~ government.

Also, they can give objectively free, fair and frank advice only when they are neutral.

Although, appointing those civil servants to highest ranks, who

Remarks

enjoy your confidence is justified on the ground that the political executive has to ultimate public mandate.

However, if these bureaucrats then go on to join politics immediately post-retirement, then we ~~have~~ can't tell whether they had been acting in public interest or private interest all ~~this~~ time.

do you think they impacts public trust?

The argument "Why waste a talent" is reasonable. But, it should be avoided because this sets a ~~bad~~ bad ~~pre~~ precedence for middle ranking bureaucrats.

couldn't there be positive intention of civil servants in joining politics?

The unintended secondary effect of wrongly motivating the bureaucracy will be far more deleterious than the primary utility of ~~not~~ retaining talent.

4

11. In an administrative hierarchy, do you see the value of obedience always as a virtue or vice or is there a need to find the golden mean? Discuss. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Obedience allows the administration to perform its set objectives. But, instead of blind obedience that might compel us to take illegal actions, we should find the golden mean in the maxims of legality, ~~stability~~ constitutionality and transparency.

Administration needs hierarchy.

~~According~~ According to Max Weber, it is one of the defining features of bureaucracy. Hierarchy ~~is~~ won't sustain if legally & properly issued orders are fulfilled and obeyed.

Therefore, if administrative ~~is~~ bureaucracy is necessary so that the limited resources ~~are~~ optimally deployed.

Remarks

for low economic development, then the orders obeyed ~~is~~ legitimately must be ~~obeyed~~ obeyed.

However, office holders in key position in ~~low~~ hierarchy might try to ~~gain~~ make private gain at the cost of public utility. Organisations being very hierarchical, they find compliant lackeys very easily.

This is where "moral compass" of individuals come into picture. They must obey rightfully issued legal orders. But, these orders go beyond the constitutional boundaries jurisdiction or may cause breach of trust then they should be ~~disobey~~ disobeyed. e.g. Nuremberg trials came with a maxim that obeying orders isn't an excuse.

Do you think <sup>legal</sup> obedience ensure accountability, checks & balance etc.

Discuss how golden mean may act as guide.

3/2

12. Does the ethicality of 'whistleblowing' depend on the perspective of a moral agent? Substantiate using examples and arguments. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Whistleblowing is an act of courage, which in itself is a moral value. Therefore, the locus of whistleblowing rests on the conscience of a moral agent.

Whistle blowing usually takes place when something illegal or immoral or both is taking place with active ~~some~~ connivance of the officials whose job was to prevent exactly that. i.e. the need for whistleblowing comes from the dereliction of duty by someone.

Then, comes the moral agent, who could always say that I am not legally or normally responsible for

these infractions. e.g. Law would not  
punish me when wrongdoing comes to  
light.

Yet, whistleblower can't live with  
himself knowing that he didn't do  
anything to stop it.

e.g. the engineer who blew the  
whistle in the Volkswagen Emission Scandal.  
had no need to jeopardise his life.

However, whistleblowers know that  
their duty to expose the truth triumphs  
their legal obligation.

Therefore, whistleblowers

Discuss what  
consideration  
shall take place  
before whistleblowers

Analyze whistleblowing on basis  
of deontology,  
virtue ethics etc.

34  
3/2

13. What are the advantages and limitations of the deontological approach to governance and in the maintenance law and order? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Deontology requires one to follow ~~one's~~ <sup>their</sup> duty. But, duties change according to circumstances and they have to be prioritised.

Deontology talks about universal adherence to duty. That, one should

disregard ~~one's~~ emotions, circumstances, etc

→ Therefore, when one is not sure what ~~Deontology will find no merit in~~ outcomes might be or when people emotionally ~~functioning out for it but are~~ demand something blatantly ~~immoral~~ ~~to the duty of upholding~~ immoral. e.g. Mob lynching. "Duty ethics" helps ~~for the welfare~~. One might say that

Duties must be framed in terms of upholding values

As W. D. Ross had said that ~~the~~ duty has to be conditional. This becomes very clear in the situations of insurgency, ~~and~~ and law and order.

Remarks

Deontologist thinker Kant said that human life is an end, not means. So, accordingly, Major Gogoi's decision to tie a suspected trouble maker to the bonnet of his jeep to deter potential stone throwers was an unethical thing.

Do you think deontology is merely impractical as it lacks human values like empathy, compassion etc.

Similarly, should the terrorist captured be not to tortured even if we know that he might have useful information to protect lives.

The idea of duty is "fluid" one may define it to wage "just wars" to prevent genocide or one might say that the duty is to uphold "sovereignty" at any cost.

3 1/2

Discuss what shall be the proper approach?

## Section - B

In the following questions carefully study the cases presented and then answer the question that follows:

14. You are the District collector of a district highly divided by the caste. You are getting complaints about mid-day meals from many schools regarding the quality of food and regularity. You have asked the school headmaster to do something about it. One headmaster changed the cook. The new cook is from the Dalit community. Parents of children belonging to higher caste have stopped sending their children to school. Attendance is sharply reduced. In the given scenario, what are the ethical issues involved? Explain the various options available to solve the problem. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

It is important to ensure that children's education doesn't suffer. But, it is equally important that justice is not compromised. After all, "learning equality" is part of education of young minds.

### \* Ethical issues

- (1) Improving overall mid-day meal infrastructure in the district as it has a ~~direct~~ bearing on education outcome of weak and vulnerable <sup>(community)</sup> children.
- (2) Protect the job of Dalit cook and bring back children into school. I.e. ~~is~~ persuading parents to change their

Remarks

do you think attitude of people is an important issue here?

casteist behaviour for it helped no one.

\* Various options ✓

(2) Do nothing → in the case of this school  
and simply improve overall mid ~~day~~ meal scheme  
→ Parents might resent earlier but, realising

that the education of their wards is  
suffering, they will soon send them ~~or~~ back.

However, if they don't feel like it, they  
could send their ~~children~~ ✓ to other schools.

The "Mid ~~Day~~ Day Meal" is now working  
efficiently elsewhere also. ✓

do you think it is  
an addition of duty?

\* But, many children may not come back

because ~~their~~ ✓ due to their  
obstinate parents or may find other  
school too far. ✓

Also, a sustained reduction in student

numbers may bring the school under the shadow of doubt.

(2) Talk to parents; set personal examples of equality and fairness.

⇒ One should target their casteist tendency. Make them realise that their children may pick this up from them. Today, they are discriminating tomorrow, they will be discriminated against.

Discuss what various long term steps could be taken for attitudinal changes.

⇒ Making it clear that any loss of their children is on them, not administration.

⇒ Invite role models, MPs, MLAs to make a public show of their fairness.

⇒ A second option appears more wholesome to address the problem. A precedent would be set for larger social reforms.

Remarks

also try to discuss more options

8

You are the education minister of a state. Recently, a lot of reports on how women teachers of secondary school dress up came and emphasized that many teachers wear ungracious and party type attire against Indian cultural ethos while they are in school. People from one cultural group meet you and want you to clearly communicate your mind about that to the public. There is an opinion in the air that such things put an indelible mark on the impressionable minds of the adolescent students about 'image of teachers' in general and 'women' in particular. The Public expects something from you in the given situation. What are the options before you? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Teachers are also free citizens whose  
rights should not be trampled unnecessarily  
 However, <sup>uniform</sup> providing a dress code for  
entire staff ~~is~~ can be a reasonable  
 way to address "normative" concerns  
 without appearing to be targetting any  
~~particular~~ particular group of individuals

\* Available options

(1) Do not pay heed to the <sup>vague</sup> objections  
 like "ungracious" and "party type"  
 attire. Image of teachers is formed

by how they teach, not much else.  
 Also, children learn to "objectify"  
 women from various other sources.

Prohibiting a particular 'wardrobe' will  
 also objectify women, i.e. nice!

descent women don't wear this or  
 that. ~~To some~~

(1) Ask the women to shun some ~~or~~  
~~some~~ ~~types~~ of clo

(2) Leave the matter to appropriate  
 school authorities. Myself, being an  
 education minister, have bigger fishes  
 to fry. Any directive from my office

will ~~not~~ ~~be~~ inevitably look like  
 moral policing and ~~to~~ divert

Remarks

Also ~~but~~ do  
 you think  
 to paying  
 attention is  
 against the  
 spirit of democracy  
 &  
 politics?

attention from teaching / education.

(3) Implement a uniform dress code for government funded / aided secondary schools.

⇒ A uniform attire at workplace will only enforce a sense of equality in the workforce.

⇒ It doesn't target any particular group.

Do you think any step shall be taken after consultation?

Conclusion ⇒

One should prefer a combination of 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> option. School teachers aren't ungracious. They know how their coworkers and children see them. They will automatically dress accordingly. Else, it might be possible that the entire charade is just moral policing.

87/2

16. You are a collector of a district where the crime rate is very high. Local elections are going on. There was a murder of a very popular local leader in broad day-light who always raised the issue of poor and downtrodden. He also represents the voice of particular community. He had received death threats many times so the administration had provided him one bodyguard. A strong and determined crowd of around ten thousand people has assembled at the collectorate with the dead body demanding immediate action against the police officials who have failed to provide necessary security to the leader. People suspect that there is a powerful leader from the ruling party. People may turn violent as anger is boiling. What options do you have? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Death of a popular leader has aroused emotions. But, the justice and law must follow due course. Justice must be done and must be seen to be ~~done~~.

A Available options.

- ① Initiate enquiry against the concerned officials to see whether there was any dereliction of duty and ensure gathered crowd that I will myself head this investigation. Till then the enquiry concludes, they could be sent

Remarks

home on leave as their lives is in danger of public reprisal.

(2) To launch a separate inquiry into the murder by state police crime branch.

Being a collector, I may not have necessary ~~skill~~ skills to lead such an investigation. Ensure people that the enquiry

will be free & fair.

Discuss what immediate steps you could take to pacify the people.

(3) As the leader was raising specific grievances of downtrodden. I will draw

up a specific list of time bound

projects that he wanted to be implemented.

I will assure the people that the dream of their mass leader would not die with him.

(10) I will request them to return the ~~to~~ body because a post-mortem is necessary. After ~~to~~ which his body will be cremated with full state honours and a <sup>bust</sup> ~~replica~~ and a school with his name will be opened in the area of same community.

★ Conclusion

A combination of above factors should ~~down~~ the inflamed passions and ensure a fair investigation.

Good!

8/2

Remarks

There is a protest in a university campus of which you are vice-chancellor. There was a conflict between the students of upper castes and Dalit community in a hostel of the university, which led to tension in the hostel and the campus. The corridor outside the Vice-Chancellor's office has been transformed into a dormitory over the last one week. A section of students have brought their belongings along with them and are sleeping in the corridor as a sign of protest demanding immediate alternate arrangement in another hostel but that is under renovation. With authorities maintaining that it will take at least four more months to complete renovation work, the 60-odd students protesting have decided not to return to their old accommodation. The Vice Chancellor called for a reconciliatory meeting between the two groups of students, but it did not yield any result. There are signs that violence may erupt in the campus. Examinations are very close and the academic atmosphere is getting disturbed. Politicians supporting a certain section of students are pressurizing the Vice Chancellor to take action against the agitating students. Being the vice chancellor of the university, what alternatives do you have to tackle the current situation? Evaluate each option. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

### \* Introduction

Preventing loss of life and, thereafter,  
conducting examination and academic  
session peacefully is the priority.

### \* Available alternatives

Call for more meeting between student groups and try to solve the so broad range of issues they face. Their outburst might be on ~~account~~ account of lack of resources

like fans, water cooler, etc. for which competing groups fight with each other. If they are provided adequately, then ~~problem~~ may vanish automatically.

Do you think famous faculties, student leaders etc could help in reconciliation?

⇒ Immediate demands for justice and blame game might scuttle this approach.

② Investigate & rusticate the students that took part in violence and make proper police bandobast in hostel area. <sup>so as to</sup> Send back students from vice chancelor's lobby.

→ Fear of punishment may bring other students in line. But, ~~it~~ this option <sup>natural justice etc.</sup> leaves a ~~better~~ better taste in mouth.

③ Let the protesting students stay in some other hostel of university. They could

Remarks

be accommodated in other hostels in smaller numbers. When the enquiry into the incidence is complete with disciplinary proceeding and the other hostel is ready, they may return.

→ The problem is that the underlying caste based tension might remain unresolved.

Do you think separate hostels a good idea?

#### 4 Conclusions

→ The vice chancellor must prevent further violence at any cost, including shutting down academic session temporarily. However, the next best option is a comprehensive dialogue between all stakeholders to bring peace, brotherhood and justice.

8

18. You, as a young civil servant, joined at a subordinate position in a state government department (Civil Supplies) at the state headquarters. You found that the senior officials and the Minister-in-charge of the department are an unholy alliance and most of the proposals regarding the allocation of essential commodities to different districts were based on their whims and fancies instead of an objective criteria. The result was that some of the districts had surplus whereas some had shortage resulting in difficulties for the people in general and marginalized sections in particular. Whenever you wanted to correct the things, your proposals were either over ruled or you were shouted back and threatened by your seniors and by the Minister. Answer the following questions:

- (a) What are the ethical issues involved in the present situation?  
 (b) What are the options before you to correct the things? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Administration must be run rationally and by objective criteria, not at the whims and fancies. The allocation of resources must be just. The concerned civil servant has an option to channelise the grievances of concerned districts into proper limelight.

(9) Ethical issues ~~involved~~ involved →

(1) Misallocation of resources is reducing quality of public service delivery overall.

(2) Bad impact on morale of ~~public~~ officials that are resource deficient.

(3) Following discretion instead of a set

Remarks

criteria in procurement and distribution certainly creates opportunity for corruption.

(4) Lack of transparency and accountability.

word!

(5) Available option.

1. To ~~begin~~ communicate with the areas that are ~~so~~ adversely affected and try to help them in any other way.

Since my proposal for setting up an objective criteria has been shot down

at the departmental level, I should

go to the ~~senior~~ chief secretary with my proposal and circulate a

brief version of it among my

Should you  
make report  
& collect data  
of irregularities?

department as a "food for thought".

3. Channelise the grievances of concerned districts through their DMs to the concerned minister and chief minister.

They should be encouraged to speak ~~at~~ their mind in the informal gatherings of senior civil servants.

\* Therefore, it is preferable if the grievances of the concerned districts should be articulated vehemently by their DMs which would allow me to push my idea of an objective procurement policy.

Could you adopt the option of whistleblowing etc if you face here?

8

You are a Superintendent of Police and a huge protest is going on in front of your office. These protesters are Human Right activists. The protest is because of two consecutive incidents that happened in your district. Case one: The city SP has received intelligence that bombs have been planted in various places in the city. The SP asked his team to conduct a massive search operation. After putting in strenuous hard work, the police team raided a house where two people with 2 kg of explosives and IED devices were found. The Police team immediately arrested them and brought them to the police station. Police started interrogating them about the whereabouts of the bombs and their plans. When they failed to get any information from them, one of the Police Officers adopted the third degree. Torture, in the case of new criminals, often works. But one of them died during the process, as he failed to bear the pain of torture. Death in police custody became a big issue. Case two: Recently communal riots occurred in your area and a few police constables got surrounded by a group, viewing the grave situation and a possible threat to life, one of them used a man as a human shield. They found it to be an easy way to escape. It could also save the life of other police constables. But while they were trying to escape, people started stone pelting and the person who was used as a human shield got badly injured. However, he was saved later by proper treatment. Answer the following questions:

- Analyse the ethical dilemmas you will face as the SP in both of the above stated situations.
- Human Rights Activists are demanding action against the officials involved in both cases. What will be your course of action?
- The Police Chief of State reaches you and asks not to take any action, as it would bring down the morale of the police force. What will be your course of action?
- Can you justify the use of torture in the given circumstances?
- Would you justify using a human as a shield to save the lives of your colleagues? Give reasons. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Q In the first case, the <sup>legal</sup> duty to protect each life was compromised for the utility of <sup>(potentially)</sup> saving many lives. Therefore, dilemma is to prioritise one of the is to furnish for torture even though the reason for torturing was potentially

utilitarianism  
against  
deontology,  
dignity etc.

legitimate.

→ In 2<sup>nd</sup> case, no lives were lost due to quick thinking cops. They used a motor as a shield, not ~~an~~ an innocent bystander. Therefore, dilemma is to discourage the use of human shield in favour of ~~else~~ some day an innocent person might die.

Could even  
wrong  
state for shield  
be justified?

(b) In first case, the concerned police official will face legal proceedings against under relevant sections of IPC. But, the mitigating circumstances must be considered for it wasn't any other instance of ~~an~~ custodial death.

Remarks

Such entities like Guantanamo Bay are maintained by ~~us~~ states to avoid a recognition of the fact that terrorism might be a unique situation that could be a mitigating ground.

In 2<sup>nd</sup> case, cops should be adequately trained and equipped to defend themselves.

The injured man could be given an ex gratia compensation. Death of policeman could have been far worse.

(c) Law appears to be clear in both cases. In first, a man died in police custody without facing ~~his~~ his day in court. Therefore, proceedings against the accused cops must take place.

In the second, cops acted simply self defence. They used a ~~man~~ man

warning against repeating any such action etc.

who had come to hurt them or possibly kill them.

(d) Terrorism is a political crime, a class apart from crimes that could be treated as law & order problem. These men had explosives on their person. They If had a person wearing explosive is caught by ~~to~~ untrained cops, who can't defuse ~~bomb~~ <sup>bomb</sup> bomb, they should kill him. Eliciting information in a time constrained environment was a necessary evil. The doctrine of double effect

Do you think principle such as permissible harm could justify it?

(e) To use an innocent person as human shield is wrong but to use a suicide bomber who had decided to grievously harm the police personnel is justified

8