



An Institute for Civil Services

IAS TOPPER'S

TEST COPY

HEMANT KALAL

RANK - 371

**ETHICS, INTEGRITY
AND APTITUDE
TEST - 3**

ETHICS, INTEGRITY AND APTITUDE

Time Allowed: 3 hrs.

Max. Marks: 250

Q.	Marks	Instructions to Candidate
1.		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• There are 19 questions.• All questions are compulsory• The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.• Content of the answer is more important than its length.• Answers must be written in the space provided. <p>Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.</p> <p><i>101 1/2</i></p>
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		
7.		
8.		
9.		
10.		
11.		
12.		
13.		
14.		
15.		
16.		
17.		
18.		
19.		

1. Invigilator Signature _____

2. Invigilator Signature _____

Name Hemant Kalal

Roll No. _____

Mobile No. _____

Date _____

Signature HkalalTime = 3:30 - 7:20 pm
(3hr 50min)

Section - A

1. "You can trust the Government to keep you content and happy so that you may give your best, but it would be unworthy of you to make that a condition of service." How is this advice of Sardar Patel important for civil servants of India in particular and any developing society in general? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Government is there to maximise welfare of citizens ^(society), thus increasing their happiness. ✓

This advice of Sardar Patel is useful & important for civil servants in following way :

- ↳ Govt. provides remuneration & other facilities to civil servants (like house rent, promotions, vehicle etc.) ~~But~~ all these will make a person (including civil servants happy & content).
- ↳ But this can't & shouldn't be made a condition of service.

Eg. In case of communal riots or facing terrorism, a civil servant may have to die a soldier's death while doing duty.

Remarks

For developing society —

- Govt. implements schemes like Vaya Vandelana, PDS (NFSA), builds infrastructure (road, dams) etc. for making people happy & content & to ensure people's empowerment.

- But this may be limited eg. during a time of war, emergency situation etc.

Do you think public services should be taken on service & not into job?

Civil servants must not be moved by happiness & pain too much; The lesson of Shagvad Gita aptly applies to them.

"सुख दुःखे समे कृत्वा लाभालाभौ जया जयौ" ||

They must do duty, inspite of happiness & pain, & should find contentment from performance of duty.

But still don't you think the material requirement couldn't be completely derived

Remarks

3/2

2. "When stakes are high, integrity becomes expensive." Put forth your understanding with suitable examples. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Integrity is ~~similitude~~ harmony between a person's thoughts, words & speech, it, *inter alia*, includes personal honesty.

When stakes are high integrity becomes expensive because -

- In some situations, keeping integrity intact is very difficult. E.g. if a civil servant (eg. BDO) is not sending a portion of money to MP/MLA, then they'll try to get him/her transferred. Frequent transfers & posting demoralises & disturbs piece of mind of civil servant (II ARC).
- Sometimes, working with integrity, may cause a person to face harassment, fake allegations, loss of limb & even life. E.g. Satyendra Dubey was killed for fighting illegitimate forces.

Despite these facts, Dr. Kalam asked students at IIT Madras lecture to "work with integrity & succeed with integrity."

Remarks

It is highly possible. If Gandhiji could work with integrity (e.g. he never compromised on values of satya & ahimsa), then it is definitely possible to ~~work~~ with integrity in free, independent & democratic India.

"Integrity Pacts", Transparency & Accountability, "Code of Conduct", ^{systemic reforms} ~~the~~ are aids to it (IARC)

↳ Good. suggest what approach civil servants may adopt to maintain their integrity for longer period.

4

3. Are civil servants morally autonomous? What checks her moral autonomy and why? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Civil servants are morally autonomous insofar as they take moral decisions based on their own discretion & judgement. But they're not autonomous to the extent that they perform moral action due to the fear of law & punishment etc.

But civil servants working on discretion means work with whim & fancies

Instruments of moral autonomy for civil servant are - conscience, his/her own moral values etc. But there are checks to moral autonomy of civil servants.

What checks her moral autonomy?

- Laws, rules & regulations. Eg. a civil servant may want to act as per conscience but rules, laws would restrict it.
- Vigilance institutions (eg. CVC, CBI, Judiciary)
- Civil society
- Seniors, MP, MLA, Ministers
- Civil Service Conduct Rules, 1964

Remarks

Why - the reasons for the checks on moral autonomy are following:

- One's moral conscience is subjective & emotive. It may not always be right. E.g. one may feel like giving job to a poor relative, on the basis of her approach. ~~But it amounts to nepotism & therefore is disallowed by conduct rules.~~
- One's moral compass is subject to errors. E.g. - ~~in~~ one may feel like eating meat or allowing cross cultural marriages is wrong. Therefore to correct such prejudiced notion of morality, Constitution & Judiciary are needed as checks.

Good!

4

4. Which of the following involve ethical dilemmas? Identify values at conflict, if any.

- (a) Arresting a person with an antisocial image under public pressure
- (b) Removing a dalit cook from MDM scheme if attendance falls down
- (c) Using public office for private gain

(150 Words) (10 Marks)

(a) Ethical dilemma -

Civil servants work for people, as their trustee. Hence they should obey public opinion.

But they also have duty to protect innocent against injustice & exploitation.

Values at conflict -

{ Respect of public opinion vs. Professionalism
 { individual human rights vs. Common Conscience.
 Arresting a person would undermine values of empathy, objectivity, impartiality, justice, Courage etc.

(b) Ethical dilemma -

Securing the attendance of students for ensuring their Right to Education is important.

But it is also duty of civil servant to fight & prevent caste discrimination &

Remarks

Introduce what you understand with ethical dilemma.

Untouchability

Values at conflict

- ↳ Utilitarian ethics (maximum happiness of maximum people) vs Kantian morality (all human beings are ends)
 Removing dalit cook will ensure Utilitarian ethics but sacrifice Kantian ethics.
- ↳ Removing dalit cook will violate Constitutional values of equality (Art 14), removing untouchability (Art 17) & liberty.

(C) b) Ethical dilemma -

- ↳ Right to development of oneself & family vs. Public duty to avoid conflict of interest & nepotism.

Values at conflict -

- ↳ Using office for private gain would amount to corruption & give up values of impartiality, selflessness, integrity etc.

But could the use of public office for personal gain be called ethical dilemma?

Remarks

(3 1/2)

5. "We stand committed to protecting honest and well meaning civil servants who might have made genuine errors in their work." Why, according to former PM Manmohan Singh, protecting the honest civil servant is important? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Honest civil servants must be protected as they are really working for the people & with spirit of service. While working so, they ~~may~~ — (Reasons)

- commit genuine errors due to necessity of risk-taking in various public projects (e.g. building dam, canals etc.)

- It might be that false allegations against a public servant is made by juniors who had been prevented from taking bribe; or due to vested interest of a businessman whose illegal project is disallowed by honest civil servant.

They may try to implicate a public servant on false charges. Hence it is necessary to protect them.

Fortunately, laws & Constitutions provide a number of safeguards — such as —

Remarks

Art. 311, Section 19 of Prevention of Corruption Act, 1988 (requirement of prior permission) etc.

Discuss various impacts on system if honest officers are not given proper protection like bureaucratic, lack of innovation etc.

342

6. "The transfer is the politicians' basic weapon of control over the bureaucracy and thus the lever for surplus-extraction from the clients of the bureaucracy." Explain.
(150 Words) (10 Marks)

Robert Wade in his study of Andhra Pradesh bureaucracy found out this. II ARC also validates such facts. Because by transfers -

↳ an honest civil servant, is tortured; If frequent transfer happens, then it'll disturb his/her peace of mind & family life. This'll affect his efficiency at work also.

↳ If a civil servant doesn't yield to demands of politician (such as giving a portion of funds allocated to politician) then politician may get him/her transferred.

↳ Public servants' ^{life} like Ashok Khemka, Kanaram etc, verifies it.

This is why NN Vohra (former bureaucrat) has called Bureaucracy - a transfer industry.

Discusses how politicians use power to transfer for vested interest for personal gain.

Remarks:

To prevent this harmful tendency, which may lead to corruption, derailing of development etc., former Lokayukta of Karnataka suggested that the power of transfer & posting may be kept within Bureaucracy itself (eg. Civil Service Board); and a minimum tenure of 3 years should be ensured.

4

Remarks

7. Pondering upon the quote: "Conscience is to law as a brush is to paint.", critically evaluate the significance of conscience as a source of ethical guidance.

(150 Words) (10 Marks)

A brush is must to apply paints on objects. A brush soaks & absorb the paint. Likewise, conscience absorbs the ethical contents from the law. Without conscience, law may be there in the letters but nobody would follow it in the spirit. Hence laws (& their ethical content) becomes useful only when conscience applies to it.

Conscience as a source of ethical guidance

Discuss how conscience may help civil servants in applying laws in particular circumstance.

- Conscience is the "inner voice" that guides a person about what is moral/immoral & right/wrong.

- As Alexander Sholstoyin remarked -

"The line separating good & evil, passes not between nations, not between classes but from the middle of every human heart"

- Conscience prevents a person from

Remarks

killing another human being; conscience impells him/her to give donation to the needy person & conscience impells a person to perform the duty well.

Hence Gandhiji remarked - "There is a court, higher than court of justice. And that is the court of Conscience".

Critical evaluation:

- Conscience is emotive & subjective; it goes sometimes against rationality & even morality.

E.g. a person may feel like - 'there is no necessity to provide LGBT rights' or 'temple entry to women at Sabarimala'.

- Conscience may make a person communal.

Thus, conscience needs to be controlled via laws, rules, regulation & the Constitution.

Do you think law shall be held in case of conflict between law & conscience

(4)

8. The response of a public servant towards the value of 'accountability' can be varied. Some may welcome it in the spirit of trustworthiness and ownership and others can despise it as liability, fear and punishment. Discuss. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Accountability is the answerability of officials for their public acts. Some officials may welcome it, while other may take it as a burden.

Accountability imposes legal duty of civil servants towards people. So he/she may be punished for non-performance of the duty. E.g. a policeman in riotous area, can be punished for not taking any action. In such cases, it is despised as liability, fear & punishment by some civil servants.

On the other hand, some civil servants take accountability as responsibility. They take it as moral step necessary to in the spirit of trustworthiness & ownership. They don't avoid & run away from accountability but make themselves self-

Remarks

Q, do you think honest officers may take accountability as an opportunity to take ownership of their good work?

accountable.

Eg. Animesh Sharan (IAS, Faridham, Chhattisgarh) opened a feedback channel on his project Sangi (motorbike ambulance for remote, tribal villages). He made the process transparent & made active grievance redressal mechanism to improve accountability.

✓, Good approach!

4½

9. Distinguish between "Code of ethics" and "Code of conduct" with suitable examples. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Code of Ethics	Code of Conduct
<p>① Non-enforceable set of values.</p> <p>② Generally positive in nature (eg. civil servants must be empathetic)</p> <p>③ They can be followed based on personal conscience & moral compass. (Moral backing)</p> <p>④ Eg. NOLAN committee suggested code of ethics for public servants which includes selflessness, honesty, openness, accountability etc.</p>	<p>Enforceable do's & don'ts.</p> <p>Generally negative in nature. Eg. civil servants can't take gifts.</p> <p>They must be followed. If not followed then civil servants can be punished. (Legal backing)</p> <p>Civil Services Conduct Rules, 1964 exemplifies it. Eg. They can't take illegal gratification, can't buy immovable property, can't become director of company etc.</p>

Introduce both briefly.

Remarks

Example -

If a civil servant, finds returning to his/her home after duty (work hours) & if he/she finds a person injured due to accident. In this case, Code of ethics would impell him/her to help; however, it is not binding legally on him/her on the grounds only of Code of Conduct.

II ~~AAC~~ suggested enforceable Code of ^{Ethics} ~~Conduct~~ & Ethics Commissioner for its implementation.

Remarks

10. In the recent past, many bureaucrats have been seen joining political parties. Does this post-retirement engagement affect the cherished value of political neutrality of civil servants in expectation of quid pro quo? (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Many bureaucrats like Mr. Arvind Kejriwal, S. Jayshankar etc. have joined political parties. This post-retirement engagement may come in direct conflict with "Neutrality" because —

- A civil servant would, in that case, beware that if I support a particular party, it will possibly give him future posts (after retirement).

This will make a person party-biased & kill neutrality.

- Arjun Jaitley had remarked —
"Pre-retirement decisions can be affected by post-retirement assignments".

In the greed to gain in future, civil servant will forsake political neutrality.

- This trend may filter down to the young officers too & they too may

Remarks

But Kejriwal
didn't join
post retirement?

Do you think
this debilitates
public
trust?

give up neutrality from ^{the beginning of their} ~~early~~ career.

Political neutrality is a foundational value of civil services & thus, must be preserved by -

- ↳ strict enforcement of Conduct rules (which provide that public servants can't canvass for political parties; their spouse may not fight election without getting permission from govt.)
- ↳ providing cooling off period of say 5 years (because a Govt. remains for 5 years in power).

But don't you think there are many advantages of bureaucrats joining politics?

3 1/2

11. In an administrative hierarchy, do you see the value of obedience always as a virtue or vice or is there a need to find the golden mean? Discuss. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Obedience refers to obeying the commands (usually of superiors). In administrative hierarchy, it can both be a virtue & a vice.

As Virtue:

- it will help in smooth functioning of administration (Eg. in implementation of developmental schemes).

accountability, experience, etc.

- without obedience, everyone'll become whimsical & there'll not be any organisation at all.

As vice:

- sometimes seniors may give illegal, immoral or illegitimate advice. Eg. to do fake encounter, or to pass a portion of funds as 'illegal gratification' to seniors.

- in this case obedience will hurt public interest.

Remarks

↳ Do you think following wrong orders without questioning may be sheer meekness?

Thus, there is need to find golden mean for 'obedience' as a value in administration.

It can be done by -

- ↳ accepting the correct orders, but in case of illegal or immoral order from superiors, ^{junior} civil servant can request them to reconsider.

Most likely, the seniors will reconsider & give modified order, in accordance with law & morality.

- ↳ In case, seniors insist on illegal order, then junior may ask for written order (As administration can't be carried by mere words).

Good approach

4

12. Does the ethicality of 'whistleblowing' depend on the perspective of a moral agent? Substantiate using examples and arguments. (150 Words) (10 Marks)

Whistleblowing refers to speaking out about a ^{secret} wrongdoing in the system, implementation of scheme etc.

Ethicality of whistleblowing:

Depends upon perspective of moral agent

↳ because a moral agent will decide whether something in the system is wrong or not.

Eg. - if a person comes to know about corruption among seniors, (s)he will blow (s) whistle based on his/her knowledge.

But in broader perspective, it doesn't depend only upon moral agent -

because one has to first exhaust all other options available within system before whistleblowing.

In this process, the

Does any
various ethical
dilemma a
whistleblower
may face
while making
choice?

Remarks

facts & analysis of the complaint would be checked & verified.

↳ even when a person herself decides to blow whistle, she may have to verify all the allegations on objective basis (facts, findings, ~~secret~~ enquiry).

Thus, it doesn't depend upon perspective of moral agent only, ~~which~~ because perspective may be merely subjective without factual grounds.

3 1/2

13. What are the advantages and limitations of the deontological approach to governance and in the maintenance law and order?
(150 Words) (10 Marks)

Deontological approach - refers to the idea of inconsequential morality, where duty is performed for the sake of duty & for ~~no~~ other ends.

Advantages in governance & law and order -

- it'll make one fearless as no fear of result will cloud thinking of a moral agent.
- it'll not be emotional; the decision'll be made on objective, rational grounds. This will help maintain impartiality in governance & in maintenance of law & order.
- it'll keep a moral agent stable (like sthitprajna of Shagwat Gita) So nothing can disturb a person (involved in governance/law & order) on the path of duty.

Remarks

Limitations

- ↳ In governance, ^{4 in law & order maintenance} consequences of action matter greatly.

Wrong consequences may mean violation of entitlements of people or loss of life (eg. during situation of communal riots).

lack of compassion, activism, etc?

- ↳ Only after evaluating possible outcomes (consequences), the schemes in developmental administration framed.

- ↳ Emotions also have their utility. (eg. E.I., empathy are necessary for moral & ethical governance).

Hence, both deontological & utilitarian approaches should be used based on circumstances.

Good explanation.

4½

Section - B

In the following questions carefully study the cases presented and then answer the question that follows:

14. You are the District collector of a district highly divided by the caste. You are getting complaints about mid-day meals from many schools regarding the quality of food and regularity. You have asked the school headmaster to do something about it. One headmaster changed the cook. The new cook is from the Dalit community. Parents of children belonging to higher caste have stopped sending their children to school. Attendance is sharply reduced. In the given scenario, what are the ethical issues involved? Explain the various options available to solve the problem. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Caste discrimination is a malaise that Indian society possess despite laws & constitution (eg. Art. 17) against it. ethical issues in this scenario are -

- Division of society & by implication absence of unity due to casteism.
 - untouchability (which Gandhiji held as the curse on India) & prevailing orthodoxy.
 - Schools ~~are~~ unable to root out casteism in these many years since Independence in India.
 - Need of persuasion & emotional intelligence is high to bring unison between castes.
 - exploitation of weaker section (eg. Dalit).
 - Values of empathy, love etc. are sacrificed.
- Stakeholders - are DC (me), higher castes, Dalits, students & society at large.

Remarks

Various options available:-

- (i) Change the cook again & this time ensure that cook is from upper caste

merits

- it'll solve the immediate problem (students from higher caste'll come) a quick fix

demerits

- the root cause of problem (eg caste discrimination) remains unaddressed against Constitutional ethos of equality, justice Constitutional morality

Also illegal act, you may be held accountable?

- (ii) I must persuade the people from higher caste -

merits

- in this rapidly changing world, breaking caste prejudices is possible. This school or other schools from the district must have teachers from Dalit (SC) & ST communities. Yet that didn't spark any such reaction

- it is in accordance with Constitutional morality & values like equality (Art 14, 17) & empathy

Remarks

Could you take legal action against parents not sending their children?

Course of Action -

- DC must make liason with Block Education officer, Headmaster & Sarpanch^{etc.} And with them & some senior citizens & reputed people, he must make appeal to people to break down caste prejudices.

He I can ^{argue} say that in bus, railway, market everywhere all communities are coming together, then merely a cook from Dalit caste doesn't make any difference.

Do you think parents + teachers etc could become the messengers of change? By not sending children to school, you (parents) are only wasting valuable time of their study. Also children will learn negative attitudes (such as discrimination) from parents. (Persuasion)

- Negative reinforcement - warning of penal action can be given, as it is illegal according to Protection of Civil Rights Act 1976 & Atrocities Act, 1987 & Constitution (Art 17).

Change in attitudes of people is a must to bring long-term transformation.

8'h
Remarks

15. You are the education minister of a state. Recently, a lot of reports on how women teachers of secondary school dress up came and emphasized that many teachers wear ungracious and party type attire against Indian cultural ethos while they are in school. People from one cultural group meet you and want you to clearly communicate your mind about that to the public. There is an opinion in the air that such things put an indelible mark on the impressionable minds of the adolescent students about 'image of teachers' in general and 'women' in particular. The Public expects something from you in the given situation. What are the options before you? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Freedom of speech & expression (Art 19)
 & Right to Life, Privacy etc. are basic ethics on which our Constitution rests. Consequently what to eat, what to dress, whom to marry etc. depends upon personal choices. But conflict arises when social norms provide for otherwise.

Ethical issues in the case are -

- freedom of women to make choices
 - social perceptions about propriety of dressing.
 - image of teachers (especially women teachers) in the society.
 - cultural & subjugation of women
 - violation of spirit of Constitution (Art. 19, 21 etc)
- adolescent age of students

Options -

- (i) Go by the social opinion & tell the women teachers to dress appropriately.

merits

[Reduces social tensions immediately this protects social perception (image) of women as mother, daughter etc.]

demerits

[gender discrimination & injustice violation of fundamental rights. impinges upon values of liberty.]

↳ also one sided action may backfire.

- (ii) Communicate clearly to the people that women teachers may wear whatever they like.

merits

[It is in accordance with SC judgement on Privacy (2017 Puttaswamy case)]

demerits

[It can cause social backlash. impractical solution in prevailing Indian society.]

also discipline in school?

- (iii) Middle Path - prepare some common understanding between group of women teachers

Remarks

& cultural groups.

merits

[prevents social backlash
does 'balanced' response is needed from a person as high as Education minister. ✓

demerits

[it can still infringe on privacy & freedom of women society'll never accept dressing style such as mini skirt. ✓

I'll opt the Option(ii) - because -

- Proper communication between leaders of both groups (women teachers) & cultural groups will diffuse any tension & improve mutual understanding of each others perspective.

- They may agree on a particular dress code (just as there is dress code for students). This is needed because it provides practical solution and also because women teachers are not autonomous individuals but part of school fraternity. In the long term modern outlook will change attitudes of society. ✓

Do you think a proper approach or soft persuasion is needed here?

87

16. You are a collector of a district where the crime rate is very high. Local elections are going on. There was a murder of a very popular local leader in broad day-light who always raised the issue of poor and downtrodden. He also represents the voice of a particular community. He had received death threats many times so the administration had provided him one bodyguard. A strong and determined crowd of around ten thousand people has assembled at the collectorate with the dead body demanding immediate action against the police officials who have failed to provide necessary security to the leader. People suspect that there is a powerful leader from the ruling party. People may turn violent as anger is boiling. What options do you have? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

The issue relates to ^{increasing} criminal tendency in politics, which is also highlighted by independent studies such as those of AD R, Lokniti etc. The issues in the case are —

- murder of a popular leader (this somewhere indicates ~~failure of~~ district administration in providing security despite death threats)
- intelligence failure from police.
- need of investigation against culprits.
- possibility of violence from crowd (there immediate need to deploy security ^{forces} arises).
- possible subjugation of a particular community.

Options

- (i) Assure people that action'll be taken against murderer & law officials.

Remarks

merits

- it can reduce boiling anger of people.
- a murder has occurred (a fact), thus enquiry & investigation of the case is a must.

demerits

- suspect (powerful leader from ruling party) may turn against me & people.
- people may still not be satisfied & may indulge in violence (as their beloved leader is killed).

Also do you think mere words may not calm them?

(ii) Act against erring police officials -merits -

- it will set an example; from next time police'll deal with incidents of crime more meticulously.

demerits

- demoralisation of police officials
- turns away attention from issue of murder.

try to discuss few more options

Course of Action:

1. Set Persuade & convince people that the culprit will be brought to book.
2. Meanwhile, keep the security forces ready to deal with any contingency/violence.

- ③ Start investigation - as per legal procedures
- send the dead body for forensic analysis
 - keep the watch over whole investigation procedure; scientific investigation will help administration to reach the culprit.
 - meanwhile, ^{I'll} ask the police department to file FIR on case of murder against unknown suspect.

Could a special team be constituted to investigate?

- ④ It may be that the police officials themselves had nexus with ^{suspect} politician from ruling party. Impartial investigation will bring the truth.

Ask the responsible police officials for the reasons for error & failure to protect the dead leader.

In all this process, liaison with SP, DSP of Collector, and completion of proper investigation without undue influence is necessary. II ARC recommended active vigilance & prohibiting criminals from competing for elections.

Remarks

17. There is a protest in a university campus of which you are vice-chancellor. There was a conflict between the students of upper castes and Dalit community in a hostel of the university, which led to tension in the hostel and the campus. The corridor outside the Vice-Chancellor's office has been transformed into a dormitory over the last one week. A section of students have brought their belongings along with them and are sleeping in the corridor as a sign of protest demanding immediate alternate arrangement in another hostel but that is under renovation. With authorities maintaining that it will take at least four more months to complete renovation work, the 60-odd students protesting have decided not to return to their old accommodation. The Vice Chancellor called for a reconciliatory meeting between the two groups of students, but it did not yield any result. There are signs that violence may erupt in the campus. Examinations are very close and the academic atmosphere is getting disturbed. Politicians supporting a certain section of students are pressurizing the Vice Chancellor to take action against the agitating students. Being the vice chancellor of the university, what alternatives do you have to tackle the current situation? Evaluate each option. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Universities are the temples of education. But such disturbing atmosphere makes them full of conflicts. Any misbehaviour & violence must be prevented as soon as possible.

could you discuss any ethical issues involved?

Options (alternatives) -

- (i) Warn ^{agitating} students that they may be rusticated & their admission may be cancelled.

Merits

All conciliatory approaches have been already tried out. Now stern warning only may serve the purpose & work as a quick fix.

Demerits

It may cause violence. The students may not return to hostel in such a conflicting environment, where they may face threat of loss of limb or even life.

Remarks

(ii) Provide for alternate arrangement at some other hostel outside university; for this, I may have to talk to VCs of other universities via district administrative authorities.

merits-

↳ provides a possible place to stay for agitating students

demerits

↳ it may further disturb the environment of other university.

↳ segregation of students based on caste?

(iii) Once again call the two groups for reconciliatory meeting; but this time call their guardians / parents too. Also ask the district administration to provide security to prevent any occurrence of violence

merits -

↳ Persuasion may help to resolve conflict.

↳ Guardians / Parents will serve as check against non-conformist behaviour of students.

Remarks

Demerits -

- Parents may be far away from university. like the previous reconciliatory meet, this meet may again fail to yield result.

Course of Action -

- I'll choose the option (iii). Here, the students whose parents live far away may be exempted from calling their parents. But they also must connect their parents through Video Conferencing during the meeting.
- Security arrangement will prevent any violence.
- I'll try my best to persuade the student groups that such a conflict will not ~~be~~ occur again. It will not be ~~tolerated~~.

Those students who are still not ready to go back to hostel, must be given warning of cancellation of admission or such strict action.

- While sending students back to hostel, some arrangements like allotting same room to students of one community may help to diffuse immediate tension.

Remarks

Do you think faculties, student leaders etc could also be involved?

8½

18. You, as a young civil servant, joined at a subordinate position in a state government department (Civil Supplies) at the state headquarters. You found that the senior officers and the Minister-in-charge of the department are an inholy alliance and most of the proposals regarding the allocation of essential commodities to different districts were based on their whims and fancies instead of an objective criteria. The result was that some of the districts had surplus whereas some had shortage resulting in difficulties for the people in general and marginalized sections in particular. Whenever you wanted to correct the things, your proposals were either over ruled or you were shouted back and threatened by your seniors and by the Minister. Answer the following questions:

(a) What are the ethical issues involved in the present situation?

(b) What are the options before you to correct the things? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

(a) Ethical issues in the case — other essential commodities.

↳ Right to food (guaranteed by Chameli Singh case & NFSA, 2013) is being violated.

— marginalised sections (possibly a particular community) entitlements are violated.

— Minister & seniors disregard the ethical issues & are ^{perhaps} indulging in corruption.

— No respect to initiatives & ideas of junior & honest officers.

— Systemic inefficiencies in the Civil Supplies department. accountability, neutrality etc. -!

— Absence of Vigilance or poor vigilance over this department.

— Unholy nexus between seniors & Ministers.

Remarks

(b) Options -

(i) Blow the whistle -

Merits

- all efforts to correct the things were overruled. So this is an alternative.
- Attention of media, judiciary & people will create external pressure over ministry.
- It is as per the values of empathy & compassion to marginalised people.

Demerits

- it breaks the chain of commands.

- I might be suspended & things might continue as usual.

- other alternatives could have been tried first before blowing whistle.

Also don't you think you must gather evidence first?

(ii) Try to persuade minister on some logical grounds -

- Tell the minister that people from district having shortage are preparing to protest against. They are filing RTIs to know the exact situation. If exposed, your

Remarks

Reputation will be hurt.

Merit -

Dem

Minister might change the course
Demerit

A person (including minister) may not become ethical overnight.

(iii) I'll Find out objective facts & analysis and then send the report to CMO.

It is expected that CMO will certainly take action against whimsical

Minister & officials. CM may even remove

the minister after knowing about facts

of my report. Similarly High Command

may take disciplinary action against the

erring seniors.

Could you also help take help of civil society to secretary to transfer the knowledge to public?

In case, all this option also doesn't work then Whistleblower act is the only safeguard. It is necessary because rights & entitlements of people in a democracy can't be stifled in any way.

Remarks

19. You are a Superintendent of Police and a huge protest is going on in front of your office. These protesters are Human Right activists. The protest is because of two consecutive incidents that happened in your district. Case one: The city SP has received intelligence that bombs have been planted in various places in the city. The SP asked his team to conduct a massive search operation. After putting in strenuous hard work, the police team raided a house where two people with 2 kg of explosives and IED devices were found. The Police team immediately arrested them and brought them to the police station. Police started interrogating them about the whereabouts of the bombs and their plans. When they failed to get any information from them, one of the Police Officers adopted the third degree. Torture, in the case of new criminals, often works. But one of them died during the process, as he failed to bear the pain of torture. Death in police custody became a big issue. Case two: Recently communal riots occurred in your area and a few police constables got surrounded by a group, viewing the grave situation and a possible threat to life, one of them used a man as a human shield. They found it to be an easy way to escape. It could also save the life of other police constables. But while they were trying to escape, people started stone pelting and the person who was used as a human shield got badly injured. However, he was saved later by proper treatment. Answer the following questions:

- Analyse the ethical dilemmas you will face as the SP in both of the above stated situations.
- Human Rights Activists are demanding action against the officials involved in both cases. What will be your course of action?
- The Police Chief of State reaches you and asks not to take any action, as it would bring down the morale of the police force. What will be your course of action?
- Can you justify the use of torture in the given circumstances?
- Would you justify using a human as a shield to save the lives of your colleagues? Give reasons.

(250 Words) (20 Marks)

(a) Ethical dilemmas before SP -

Case 1:

Protecting the general people from terror attack vs. protecting adopting human rights approach during investigation & interrogation
human rights of (possibly) terrorists vs. human rights (including right to life) of Common People

Remarks

Case 2:

using a person as human shield (using human being as means) to save life of police constable, which threaten life of a common ~~the~~ person Vs. Right to life of constables.

whether S.P. ~~had done~~ ^{does} anything wrong by acquitting the constables.

Dignity of individual etc 2

(b) Course of action -

- ensure Human Rights Activists that proper investigation'll be carried out in both cases.

(This is in accordance with Nalimath Committee report on Police Reform)

- Guilty police officer/constable will be brought to book. (Instead of third degree, if all other methods were exhausted, then police officer had no other choice).

So on the basis of examination of all circumstances, action will be taken.

Remarks

(c) As an SP, I've to obey the commands of DGP (Police Chief of State). However, I'll try to persuade DGP that proper investigation of the case is necessary to bring justice. It is also necessary to protect the image of State Police. (This is required also in accordance with VN Declaration of Human Rights, 1948)

(d) Torture must not be used as first means. However, to know about bomb blast planning, for saving life of many innocent people (which include marginalised sections like women, children, aged), it may at times be necessary to protect larger public interest. (Utilitarian Approach to ethics)

✓
↳ permissible harm or?

(c) Use of Humans as a shield is completely inappropriate. either state police could have assured proper strength of personnel during at that location, on the basis of intelligence.

Discuss how this episode may have impacted the person involved as shield?

Using human beings as means to save one's life is also against Kantian dictum.

In such trying situations, police force deployment should be wisely done to avoid facing this kind of direct threat to life or at least this would minimise casualty to many police personnel.

8½